

NABT Biology Education Research Symposium Proposal Review Rubric

	5	4	3	2	1
Subject/ Problem	Theoretical rationale (conceptual model, formal philosophies, etc.) is clearly communicated and forms the basis of the proposal. Knowledge gap to be addressed is justified and expressed clearly.	Theoretical rationale is appropriate and sufficiently explored. Connection between knowledge gap and theoretical rationale is present but needs strengthening.	Theoretical rationale is appropriate and sufficiently explored. Connection between knowledge gap and theoretical rationale is incomplete.	Theoretical rationale is inappropriate and/or insufficiently explored. Connection between knowledge gap and theoretical rationale may need to be revisited.	Educational context in which the study occurred is described without a broader theoretical rationale to frame the subject/problem
Design/ Procedure	Design of study, sampling scheme, data collection and analysis methods, and other protocols are completely explained and appropriate to the subject/problem presented.	As appropriate, one of these items is incompletely explained: design of study, sampling scheme, data collection & analysis methods, and other protocols. This shortcoming does not interfere with understanding of the analyses and findings	As appropriate, one of these items is incompletely explained and/or align imperfectly to the subject/problem: design of study, sampling scheme, data collection & analysis methods, and other protocols. Missing information begins to interfere with understanding and/or validity of the analyses and findings.	As appropriate, more than one of these items is incompletely explained and/or align imperfectly to the subject/problem: design of study, sampling scheme, data collection & analysis methods, and other protocols. Missing information significantly interferes with understanding and/or validity of the analyses and findings.	Design of study is weakly connected to the subject/problem.
Analyses and Findings	Results are appropriately summarized qualitatively and/or quantitatively, interpretation addresses the subject/problem of the proposal, and conclusions logically follow from the data. Synthesis of ideas is appropriate and complete.	One of the criteria for the top rating is not fully met (e.g., interpretation of the results does not completely align to subject/problem presented).	Two of the criteria for the top rating are not fully met, or one of the criteria is lacking (see lowest rating).	All of the criteria for the top rating are not fully met, or two of the criteria are lacking (see lowest rating; e.g., synthesis of ideas is absent though results are summarized).	Trends in data are difficult to ascertain from narrative, figures, and/or text. Conclusions are incompletely supported by the data shown. Synthesis of ideas is absent though results are summarized.
Contribution	Conclusions and contributions are clearly articulated and contribute valuable insights into the teaching/learning of biology	Contributions are clearly articulated. Insights into the teaching/learning of biology are somewhat underestimated and should be revised.	Contributions are clearly articulated. Insights into the teaching/learning of biology are somewhat overestimated and should be revised.	Contributions (beyond the context in which the research took place) are not clearly articulated such that insights into teaching/learning of biology can be assessed in terms of value	Conclusions are limited to the teaching/learning context in which the research took place.
General Interest	Proposal clearly describes work that is of general interest to all members of NABT.	Proposal clearly describes work that is of general interest to a large group of NABT members.	Proposal describes work that has the potential to be of general interest to a large group of NABT members; further development of general interest is needed.	Proposal describes work that is of specific interest to a small focal group of NABT members.	Proposal describes work that is of limited interest to a small focal group of NABT members.